GENEALOGY AND CLASSIFICATION OF RIGHTS EXPRESSION LANGUAGES – PRELIMINARY RESULTS

Tassilo Pellegrini^{1,} Andrea Schönhofer¹, Sabrina Kirrane², Simon Steyskal², Anna Fensel³, Oleksandra Panasiuk³, Victor Mireles-Chavez⁴, Thomas Thurner⁴, Axel Polleres², Markus Dörfler⁵

¹ Fachhochschule St. Pölten, Department Medienwirtschaft, Matthias Corvinus Straße 15, 3100 St. Pölten, AT

⁴ Semantic Web Company, Neubaugasse 1, 10170 Vienna, AT

⁵ Höhne, In der Maur & Partner, Mariahilfer Str. 20, 1070 Wien, AT

Keywords: Rights Expression Languages, Genealogy, Classification, Legal Technologies

Abstract: Rights Expression Languages (RELs) are a central component of contemporary digital rights management systems. They are applied to express permissions, obligations and prohibitions in a machine-processable form. Since the early 1990s we can observe a massive increase in the uptake of RELs for purposes such as access control, license management or contracting. This paper presents a genealogy of RELs since 1989, proposes a classification that helps better understand their functional focus and application area and gives an outlook on research perspectives.

1. Problem Statement

A central requirement of any Digital Rights Management system is a machine-readable knowledge representation language known as Rights Expression Language (REL) (Jamkhedkar and Heileman, 2004). RELs are used to explicate machine-readable rights for purposes such as access control, trust management and contracting (Garcia et al. 2004/2007/2009). RELs are used to govern behavioural aspects and explicate usage rights that occur during digitally mediated interactions between two or more parties (Pellegrini 2014). RELs should be understood as a grounding component of legal technologies as their primary purpose is to express, govern and sanction legally binding behaviour within technologically mediated environments.

Among the most prominent RELs are MPEG-21, ODRL-2.0 (and derivatives such as OMA DRM or RightsML), ccREL and XACML to name but a few (Ermilov & Pellegrini 2015). Most RELs have been developed according to the needs of specific sectors. In particular, MPEG-21, OeBFRel, XMCL, PRISM and TV-Anytime RMPI are optimized for rights management purposes in the area of multimedia and media asset management (Rodriguez-Doncel & Delgado 2009). RELs such as WSLA, WS-Agreement, SLAng, WSPL or WS-Policy support access control, trust management and contracting for web services. Finally, RELs such as ccREL (Creative Commons Rights Expression Language) or ODRL (Open Digital Rights Language) are designed for general purposes and have gained popularity especially in the area of content and data licensing (Rodriguez et al. 2015; Sande et al. 2012).

[[]firstname.lastname]@fhstp.ac.at; http://www.fhstp.ac.at

² Vienna University of Business & Economics, Institute of Information Business, Welthandelsplatz 1, 1020 Vienna, AT

³ University of Innsbruck, STI2 International, Technikerstraße 21a, 6020 Innsbruck, AT

A recent literature analysis conducted by the authors in the preparation of this paper revealed that more than 60 RELs have been developed since the early 1990s, some being derivatives of older ones (i.e. MPEG-21 being the successor of XrML) and some being developed to serve completely new purposes (i.e. LDR to manage interlinked data sources). These developments illustrate that RELs are a vital area of research whose relevance might even increase with the growing degree of automation and algorithmic governance in areas such as e-commerce, e-procurement or IT-security to name but a few (Prenafeta 2010; Gangadharan & D'Andrea 2011a; Villata & Gandon 2012).

The REL landscape is characterized by technical heterogeneity and a high degree of diversification. Hence it is important to develop a good understanding of various REL types and their functional scope. Hence this paper presents preliminary results from an extensive literature review aiming at developing a genealogy of RELs and proposing a classification that illustrates the intended application areas of each REL for digital rights management purposes.

The paper is structured as follows: Section 2 briefly outlines the methodology. Section 3 investigates the history of RELs, discusses their application areas and introduces a genealogy of RELs in the timespan from 1989 to 2015. Section 4 gives and outlook on research perspectives and future work.

2. Methodology

The findings presented in this paper have been derived from an extensive, systematic literature review conducted on published works between 1989 and 2015. The analysed corpus has been compiled from the databases IEEE, ACM and SpringerLink and complemented by an analysis of references given in peer-reviewed academic works. In total this resulted in a literature corpus of 301 scientific or technical papers, each having an explicit reference to RELs as subject of research. The analysed RELs are either officially supported standards (i.e. by MPEG, OASIS or ISO), recommended norms (i.e. W3C recommendations) or community contributions (i.e. provided by research groups or individuals). A full list of analysed RELs can be found in Appendix 1.

During the first analytic phase each REL has been assigned a publication year thus allowing to draw a corresponding timeline. In a second phase we developed a REL genealogy illustrating the technical dependency of various RELs during their evolution. In a third phase we derived a classification of RELs by analysing the functional purpose in correspondence with their application area.

3. Results

In the following sections we provide brief discussions of the results derived from our literature survey.

3.1. A brief history of RELs

According to Jamkhedkar & Heileman (2008) the appearance of RELs was a reaction to the radical changes invoked by modern information technology and the Internet on the existing balance between intellectual property owners and consumers at the end of 1980s. The occurring disturbances invoked by massive and loss-free sharing of copyright protected assets led intellectual property owners to put pressure on technologists to develop effective DRM systems to prevent violation of copyright by consumers. The first REL was introduced by McCarty (1989) in the year 1989 and was called *Language for Legal Discourse (LLD)*. It was based on a deontic framework and its central idea was to "develop a deep conceptual model [...] by selecting a small set of common categories such as, space, time, action, permissions, obligations, constraints, and so on, relevant to a particular legal domain, and then developing a knowledge representation language that reflects the structure of this set" (Jam-khedkar & Heileman 2008, p. 3).

By the mid 1990's the development of RELs gained traction when Stefik and Casey (1994) filed a patent for DRM technology they developed at Xerox PARC. Their REL went beyond McCarty's

approach as it included the description of a "usage rights grammar" that was subsequently implemented in LISP and called the Digital Rights Property Language (DRPL) (ibid). Nowadays most existing and functional RELs conform to the axiomatic principles of rights modelling first laid down by *LLD* and *DPRL* (Prados et al. 2005) and have made serious advancements with respect to functionality, design and interoperability. Since 1989 more than 60 RELs have appeared throughout literature, and they have become an integral component of most IT-systems in the context of digital rights management applications and web services.

3.2. Application areas of RELs

RELs are applied to express policies. According to Sloman (1994) policies define a relationship between subjects and targets within a policy domain. For the domain of digital rights management Chong et al. (2006, p. 290f) distinguish between six policy types known as 1) revenue policies, 2) provision policies, 3) operational policies, 4) contract policies, 5) copyright policies and 6) security policies. General purpose RELs such as MPEG-21 or ODRL by definition support all of these policies but also come along with specific strengths and limitations according to their functional design. Special purpose RELs covering just one or closely related policy domains are extending the application scope of general purpose RELs but also raise the level technological complexity and evoke interoperability issues (Prados et al. 2005).

We applied Chong et al.'s policy types to our literature analysis but due to reasons of simplicity came up with a threefold distinction of main application areas in the DRM domain, namely 1) access & trust policies, 2) license policies and 3) contracting policies. These three application areas have proven to be analytically reasonable given that the high amount or RELs discovered during our literature review prevented us from an in depth functional analysis of each REL according to Chong et al.'s classification.

Given that, the three main application areas for RELs can be defined as follows:

Contract Policies: According to Guth (2004, p. 81) a digital contract is a legally binding agreement of two or more parties, on the exchange of rights to (digital) goods or services under certain terms and conditions. A contract can be used as evidence to prove acceptance of liabilities and RELs can be applied to preserve these liabilities in the face of possible contingencies for the contract's duration (Rodriguez et al. 2015, p. 64). Thus, RELs can be applied to represent contracts in machine-readable form thus enabling automated processing and execution of contracts i.e. with respect to individual usage patterns, payment and enforcement purposes.

License Policies: According to Guth (2004, p. 82) a license should be understood as a specific type of contract granting general usage rights to intellectual property, technical know-how or technical inventions. Consequently, a license is used to express generalized terms about the intended usage pattern of a certain asset and usually defines the notion of property associated with a specific asset (such as declaring the degree of permissiveness allowed in the reuse of a certain asset). RELs are applied to represent licenses in a machine-readable form i.e. for purposes of similarity detection, compatibility checks and compliance with given terms and condition.

Access & Trust Policies: The last category refers to actions like authentication, authorization and security preservation. *Access policies* define permissions, restrictions or prohibitions associated with an asset for making this asset available to a user in a specific role or other related feature of distinction (Kirrane et al. 2015).¹ Additionally access policies can be used to explicate service level agreements and define the conditions of service delivery with respect to quality of service, security and privacy issues. Complementary to that, *trust policies* express conditions for interactions between entities that

¹ Kirrane et al. (2015) distinguish between six access control models: Mandatory Access Control (MAC), Discretionary Access Control (DAC) and Role Based Access Control (RBAC), View Based Access Control (VBAC), Attribute Based Access Control (ABAC) and Context Based Access Control (CBAC).

don't know each other and where a sufficient level of confidentiality and privacy should be preserved for a specific context or duration (Aradhana 2011). RELs applied to the explication of access and trust policies usually capture higher-level goals. Such policies provide the means for specifying and modulating the terms of an asset and align its capabilities and constraints with the requirements of its users (Gangadharan & D'Andrea 2011b).

Each REL can be used to express policies for either one or several of these application areas at various degrees of granularity and specificity. Hence, we can distinguish between general purpose RELs (such as ODRL, MPEG-21 being the most prominent ones) and special purpose RELs targeted at one or two specific application areas. Figure 1 illustrates the assignment of RELs to their policy domain(s).



Fig 1: Classification of RELs according to their application area

The findings reveal that most RELs have been developed for the purpose of access and trust management which is insofar plausible as access and trust policies usually lay the foundation on which contract and licensing policies are being executed and enforced. This is also replicated in the fact that 39 out of 62 RELs contain functional features related to access and trust management, especially when an intersection with contract policies is given. 28 out of 62 RELs support contract management and 24 out of 62 RELs are related to license management. Special purpose RELs are either specifically designed to serve these areas as stand-alone RELs or come along as specific functional extensions of general purpose RELs often as result of a community initiative governed by an official standardization body or industry working group.

3.3. A genealogy of RELs

Figure 2 illustrates a genealogy of RELs between 1989 and 2015 based on the literature review underlying this study. The timeline indicates the point in time when the REL has either become an officially supported standard or recommendation or has been introduced to the scientific discourse for the first time. The dotted lines between the RELs indicate their technological interdependence and

genealogy. The assigned colours indicate the functional spectrum of each REL according to the application areas described in section 3.2.

We discovered a total of 61 RELs in the given time period with a massive increase in REL development between 2000 and 2005. 44 out of 61 RELs have been introduced in this time period either as proof of concept or as part of official standardization initiatives carried out under the auspices of The Moving Picture Experts Group (i.e. MPEG-21), the W3C (i.e. ODRL), the Open Mobile Alliance (i.e. OMA DRM) or the International Press & Telecommunications Council (i.e. ACAP and RightsML).

Despite these prominent examples for official standardization initiatives the majority of RELs (43 out of 61) – especially if designed for special purposes – is subject to community or research initiatives (i.e. LicenseScript, Ponder, KAoS, Protune, METSRights, L4LOD) or commercial endeavours (i.e. EPAL, WS-Policy, PRISM ML).

Another finding relates to the appearance of special purpose RELs over the course of time. In the early days of REL development access and trust policies dominated the community and industry endeavours, followed by contract policies and finally by license policies. The relatively late appearance of license policies can be interpreted as a reaction to the growing popularity of open and commons-based licensing models applied to content and data over the previous years and the complexity with respect to copyright issues arising from the combination of open and closed licensing models.

Overall our findings suggest that only a handful of RELs are being constantly maintained and advanced according to the requirements of contemporary IT systems. In contrast the majority of identified RELs seems to run short of continuous support either because they have just been developed as a proof of concept or they have been superseded by other RELs.

4. Future Work

This is paper presented the first results from an extensive literature review on RELs. The results have been validated by the authors but are still subject to further investigation and elaboration. Nevertheless, the results already give a good insight into the development, state of the art and future direction of REL-related research.

In our future work – which goes beyond the scope of this paper – the authors will extend their classification scheme not just by looking at the application areas and functional similarities but also by investigating the technological design and functional interdependence of RELs. Further on we plan to compare RELs according to their design principle, data model, the expressivity of their vocabulary and their serialization, based on concrete examples for instance for licences or contracts in terms of which aspects are expressible and how in each language. This will provide us with a deeper insight into the syntactic and semantic interoperability of existing RELs and their applicability within interconnected IT-systems.

5. Acknowledgements

Funded by the Austrian Federal Ministry of Transport, Innovation and Technology (BMVIT) under the program "ICT of the Future" in the DALICC project. Runtime: November 2016 - October 2018. More information https://iktderzukunft.at/en/ and https://www.dalicc.net



Fig 2: Genealogy and Classification of RELs from 1989 to 2015

6. Literature

Aradhana, Chana, I., 2011. Developing trust policies for cloud scenarios. IEEE, pp. 389–393. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICCCT.2011.6075147

Ermilov, I., & Pellegrini, T. (2015). Data licensing on the cloud: empirical insights and implications for linked data (S. 153–156). ACM Press.

Gangadharan, G.R., D'Andrea, V., 2011a. Managing Copyrights and Moral Rights of Service-Based Software. IEEE Software, pp. 48-55. 0740-7459/11

Gangadharan, G.R., D'Andrea, V., 2011b. Service licensing: conceptualization, formalization, and expression. Service Oriented Computing and Applications 5, 37–59. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11761-011-0079-6

García, R., & Gil, R. (2009). Copyright Licenses Reasoning an OWL-DL Ontology. In Proceedings of the 2009 Conference on Law, Ontologies and the Semantic Web: Channelling the Legal Information Flood (p. 145–162). Amsterdam: IOS Press.

García, R., Gil, R., & Delgado, J. (2007). A web ontologies framework for digital rights management. Artificial Intelligence and Law, 15(2), 137–154. http://doi.org/10.1007/s10506-007-9032-6.

García, R., Gil, R., & Delgado, J. (2004). Intellectual Property Rights Management Using a Semantic Web Information System. In R. Meersman & Z. Tari (Hrsg.), On the Move to Meaningful Internet Systems 2004: CoopIS, DOA, and ODBASE (Bd. 3290, S. 689–704). Berlin, Heidelberg: Springer Berlin Heidelberg. Abgerufen von http://link.springer.com/10.1007/978-3-540-30468-5 44.

Guth S. (2004). Interoperability of Digital Rights Management Systems via the Exchange of XML-based Rights Expressions. Dissertation: University of Vienna

Hohfeld, W. (1923). Fundamental Legal Conceptions: as applied in judicial reasoning. In: Cook, W.W. (Ed.). New Haven Jamkhedkar, P.A., Heileman, G.L., 2008. A formal conceptual model for rights. ACM Press, p. 29. https://doi.org/10.1145/1456520.1456528

Kirrane, Sabrina; Mileo, Alessandra; Decker, Stefan (2015). Access Control and the Resource Description Framework: A Survey. In: Semantic Web Journal. See also: http://www.semantic-web-journal.net/content/access-control-and-resource-description-framework-survey.

Lazarev, N. (2005). Hohfeld's Analysis of Rights: An Essential Approach to a Conceptual and Practical Understanding of the Nature of Rights. In: Murdoch University Electronic Journal of Law 2005/9, See also: http://www.austlii.edu.au/au/journals/MurUEJL/2005/9.html, accessed January 10, 2018

McCarty, L. T. (1989). A Language for Legal Discourse I. Basic Features. In ICAIL '89: Proceedings of the 2nd international conference on Artificial intelligence and law, pages 180–189, New York, NY, USA.

Pellegrini, T. (2014). Linked Data Licensing – Datenlizenzierung unter netzökonomischen Bedingungen. In E. Schweighöfer et al. (Hrsg.), Transparenz. 17. Int. Rechtsinformatik Symposium IRIS 2014. Wien: OCG Verlag.

Prenafeta, J. (2010). Protecting Copyright Through Semantic Technology. Publishing Research Quarterly, 26(4), 249–254.

Prados, J., Rodriguez, E., Delgado, J., 2005. Interoperability between Different Rights Expression Languages and Protection Mechanisms. Presented at the First International Conference on Automated Production of Cross Media Content for Multi-Channel Distribution (AXMEDIS'05), IEEE, Florence, Italy, pp. 145–152. doi:10.1109/AXMEDIS.2005.28

Rodriguez-Doncel, V., & Delgado, J. (2009). A Media Value Chain Ontology for MPEG-21. IEEE Multimedia, 16(4), 44–51. http://doi.org/10.1109/MMUL.2009.78.

Rodriguez, E., Delgado, J., Boch, L., & Rodriguez-Doncel, V. (2015). Media Contract Formalization Using a Standardized Contract Expression Language. IEEE MultiMedia, 22(2), 64–74. http://doi.org/10.1109/MMUL.2014.22.

Safavi-Naini R., Sheppard N. P., Uehara T. (2004). Import/Export in Digital Rights Management. In: DRM, Jiayias, A., CCS, Association for Computing Machinery (Eds.), 2004. Proceedings of the Fourth ACM Workshop on Digital Rights Management: Washington, DC, USA, October 257, 20043 ; co-located with CCS 2004. Association for Computing Machinery, New York, NY.

Sande, Miel Vander; Portier, Marc; Mannens, Erik; Van de Walle, Rik (2012). Challenges for open data Usage: Open Derivatives and Licensing. In: https://www.w3.org/2012/06/pmod/pmod2012_submission_4.pdf, accessed February 12, 2016

Sloman M. (1994). Policy driven management for distributed systems. In: Journal of Network and Systems Management, 333(2).

Stefik, M. J., & Casey, M. M. (1994, November). Rights Expression Languages of Digital Works. Xerox Corporation, U.S. Patent No. 5,629,980.

Villata, S. and Gandon, F. (2012). Licenses compatibility and composition in the web of data. In: Consuming Linked Data (COLD) - Workshop in conjunction with the 11th International Semantic Web Conference 2012. CEUR WS Proceedings, 905.

Weitzner, D.J., Hendler, J., Berners-Lee, T., Connolly, D., 2006. Creating a policy-aware web: Discretionary, rule-based access, in: Web and Information Security. IRM Press

7. Appendix 1: RELs Overview

1989 LDD Langaage for Legal Discourse McCarty 1995 DPR1 10 Digital Property Rights Language v10 Xerox Park 1998 DPR2 20 Digital Property Rights Language v2.0 Kerox Park 1998 DPR2 20 Digital Property Rights Language v2.0 Kerox Park 1998 DPR1 40 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2000 XXML 10 eXtensible Right Markup Language Lobs, Maria & Xarpt 2000 Dockog - Tas & Thoon Tas & Thoon 2000 Dipeline O'Trust Policy Language Boratit & Samarati Boratit & Samarati 2001 PSP1 Portolotic and Service Protection Language Boratit & Samarati Boratit & Samarati 2001 DORL 1.0 Oren Digital Rights Language v1.0 W3C W3C 2001 SKC Enterprise Contrast Language Zero-Knowledge Systems & IBM 2001 NSC Enterprise Noracy Marku Language v1.0 W3C W3C 2002 KARM N10 OMA TDRN Rights Enterprise Contrast Language v1.0 W3C M3C 2002 <td< th=""><th>Year</th><th>Abbreviation</th><th>Full Name</th><th>Maintained by</th></td<>	Year	Abbreviation	Full Name	Maintained by
1995 DPRI. 1 Digital Property Rights Language v1.0 Xerx Park 1995 Poder Daminaou, Dulay, Lupu & Sloman 1995 Poder Park 2.0 Digital Property Rights Language v2.0 Rerx Park 1996 KeyNove Elaze, Frigershaum, Joannida & Keromytis 1997 PDI Policy Description Language Lobo, Bharia & Naqvi 2000 XrML 1.0 Chrenold Right Markup Language v1.0 Contest Guard (a Xerov Park Spin Off) 2000 JDIPL (Defined) Trust Policy Language Bonati & Samarati 2000 PAPL Perfolio and Service Protection Language Bonati & Samarati 2001 ORD I.0 Open Digital Rights Language v1.0 W3C 2001 XMC. Extensible Media Commerce Language RealNetworks 2001 REMI Privery Rights Markup Language Zero-Knowledge Systems & HBM 2001 FPML Frivery Rights Markup Language v1.0 Qiesi Mohle Allance 2002 FPMI 1 Other Digital Rights Language v1.0 Qiesi Mohle Allance 2002 RVMT. 2.0 Algebre Expresision Language v1.0	1989	LLD	Language for Legal Discourse	McCarty
1995 DPRL 20 Digital Property Rights Language V2.0 Marminou, Duly, Lupu & Stoman 1995 DPRL 20 Digital Property Rights Language V2.0 Kerox Mark 1997 PDL Policy Description Language V1.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2000 XML 1.0 eXensible Right Markup Language V1.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2000 PSPL Portfolio and Service Protection Language Bonatit & Samarati 2001 XMC Allocation Policy Language Bonatit & Samarati 2001 PSPL Portfolio and Service Protection Language Bonatit & Samarati 2001 NMC 1.0 Open Dagital Rights Language V1.0 W3C 2001 FKC 1 Enterprise Privacy Markup Language Zero-Knowledge Systems & IBM 2001 PRML Privacy Rights Markup Language V2.1 W3C 2001 PRML 1.0 Open Digital Right Language V1.0 W3C 2002 OPRL 1.1 Open Digital Right Language V1.0 W3C 2003 SML CPP/A 2.0 Agreement 2.0 Content Gaard (A xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 OPRL 1.1	1995	DPRL 1.0	Digital Property Rights Language v1.0	Xerox Park
1998 DPRL 2 0 Digital Property Rights Language v 2.0 Xerox Park 1998 KeyNor Bizze, Friggenbuum, Jonandis & Keromytis 1998 KeyNor Follow Description Language v 1.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin OIf) 2000 XiKL 10 eXtensible Kight Markup Language v 1.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin OIf) 2000 PSPL Portfoliu and Service Protection Language Bonati & Samanti 2000 PSPL Portfoliu and Service Protection Language Bonati & Samanti 2000 PAPL Portfoliu and Service Protection Language Bonati & Samanti 2001 ORL 1.0 Open Digital Right Sanguage v1.0 W2C 2001 NACL Extensible Markup Language RealNetworks 2001 FEML Enterprise Privacy Markup Language Zero-Knowledge Systems & IBM 2001 FEML Frenzy Markup Language Zero-Knowledge Systems & IBM 2002 XML 20 OMA DBM 100 OMA DBM 100 OMA DBM 100 2002 XML 20 OMA DBM 100 OMA DBM 100 OMA 20 2002 XML 20 Deno	1995	Ponder		Damianou, Dulay, Lupu & Sloman
1998 KeyNore Biaz. Fegenbaum, Ioamids & Keromytis 2000 XrML 1.0 eXtensible Right Markup Language Lob, Dibitis & Nayu 2000 DocLog Extensible Right Markup Language Lob, Dibitis & Nayu 2000 DocLog Extensible Right Markup Language IBM. Research 2000 PSPL Portfolio and Service Protection Language Boatt & Samarati 2000 PSPL Portfolio and Service Protection Language Boatt & Samarati 2001 XPC Protensible Mola Commerce Language Boatti & Samarati 2001 XPC Extensible Mola Commerce Language Neal 2001 EXEC Enterprise Privacy Markup Language Terroin Castano & Ferrari 2001 EXEC Enterprise Privacy Markup Language Terroin Castano & Ferrari 2002 ODKI, L1 Open Digital Rights Language V1 W3C 2002 eXML Open Bright Markup Language Content Guard Ta Xerox Yark Spin Off) 2002 eXML Collaboration Protocol Profile and Castox Fark Spin Off) 2002 eXML Colaboration Protocol Profile and Castox Fark Spin Off) <td>1998</td> <td>DPRL 2.0</td> <td>Digital Property Rights Language v2.0</td> <td>Xerox Park</td>	1998	DPRL 2.0	Digital Property Rights Language v2.0	Xerox Park
1997 Policy Description Language Lobo, Bhain & Naqvi 2000 XML 1.0 eXtensible Right Markup Language v1.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2000 DocLog Tan & Thoen Hist & Samarati 2000 PXPL Portfolio and Service Protection Language Bonatti & Samarati 2000 PXPL Portfolio and Service Protection Language Bonatti & Samarati 2001 DDKL 1.0 Opp Digital Rights Language v1.0 W3C 2001 XMCL eXtensible Media Commerce Language Real/Networks 2001 XSEC Interprise Contract Language Xero-Knowledge Systems & HBM 2001 XSEC Privacy Rights Markup Language v1.0 W3C 2002 XARD 10 OMA DRM 16 MMA DRM Rights Expression Language v1.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 XMRL 1.0 Cextensible Right Markup Language v1.0 W3C 2002 XARD 1.0 OMA DRM 10 MAT. Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.0 OASIS 2002 XPML 1.0 Relifier Straine Language v1.0 W3C OASIS 2002 P	1998	KeyNote		Blaze, Feigenbaum, Ioannidis & Keromytis
2000 XrML 1.0 cXtensible Right Markup Language V1.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2000 DocLog Tax & Theorn 2000 Diverse Protection Language IBM Research 2000 PSPL Periodio and Service Protection Language Ibonati & Samarati 2000 PSPL Periodio and Service Protection Language Ibonati & Samarati 2001 XMCL eXtensible Media Commerce Language Ibonati & Samarati 2001 XMCL Extensible Media Commerce Language RealNetworks 2001 FML Enterprise Contract Language Vi3C 2001 FML Enterprise Contract Language Zero-Knowledge Systems & IBM 2001 FML Enterprise Privacy Markup Language V1.0 W3C 2002 CML 1.0 Opin Digital Rights Language V1.0 W3C 2002 CML 1.0 OMA DRM sight Expression Language V1.0 W3C 2002 MML CPI/A 2.0 greement V2.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 APPEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language V1.0 W3C 2002 <t< td=""><td>1999</td><td>PDL</td><td>Policy Description Language</td><td>Lobo, Bhatia & Nagyi</td></t<>	1999	PDL	Policy Description Language	Lobo, Bhatia & Nagyi
2000 Docklog Fan & Theen 2000 (D)TPL (Defined) Trust Policy Language IBM Research 2000 PSPL Porfiolo and Service Protection Language Bonatit & Samarati 2000 PSPL Porfiolo and Service Protection Language Bonatit & Samarati 2001 ORL 1.0 Open Digital Rights Language V Wa's 2001 XMCL eXtensible Media Commerce Language RealNetworks 2001 XMCL eXtensible Media Commerce Language Neal 2001 XMCL eXtensible Media Commerce Language Zero-Knowledge Systems & IBM 2001 PKML Privacy Rights Markup Language V.1 W3C 2002 VAX MRM 1.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression anguage V.1 W3C 2002 XAX MRM 1.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression anguage V.1 W3C 2002 XML TOP /A.20 CMACMANG Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement V.2 OASIS 2002 PAPL Dentite Privacy Preference Exotes Control Markup Language V.1 W3C 2003 RPEI 1.0 Paltoreme Exotes Control Markup Language V.1 W3C	2000	XrML 1.0	eXtensible Right Markup Language v1.0	Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off)
2000 (D)TPL (Defined) Trust Policy Language IBM Research 2000 PSPL Portfolio and Service Protection Language Bonatit & Samarati 2001 PARL Person Allocation Policy Language Bonatit & Samarati 2001 XMC1 extensible Media Commerce Language W3C 2001 XMC1 extensible Media Commerce Language Neal 2001 LCL Enterprise Contract Language Neal 2001 FNFC Hertino, Castano & Ferrari 2001 PSPC Bertino, Castano & Ferrari 2001 NSFC Hertino, Castano & Ferrari 2002 ODRL 1.1 Open Digital Rights Language V.1 W3C 2002 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language V.0 Open Mobile Alliance Open Mobile Alliance 2002 AMA DRM Rights Expression and Interpretation V 1.0 Kagal. Poloteci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Systera 2002 APPEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language Tok Kagal. Poloteci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Systera 2002 APPEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language Tok; Pauser, Kagal. Poloteci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Systera <t< td=""><td>2000</td><td>DocLog</td><td></td><td>Tan & Thoen</td></t<>	2000	DocLog		Tan & Thoen
2000 PSPL Portfolio and Service Protection Language Bonatti & Samarati 2000 PAPL Person Allocation Policy Language Bonatti & Samarati 2001 ODR 1.0 Open Digital Rights Language V1.0 W3C 2001 K.K.C. Extensible Media Commerce Language RealNetworks 2001 K.C. Extensible Media Commerce Language RealNetworks 2001 K.S.EC Bertino, Castano & Fernan 2001 K.S.EC Bertino, Castano & Fernan 2002 MAN DDM N Bits Expression Language V1.0 Open Mobile Allance 2002 MAN DDM N Bits Expression Language V1.0 Open Mobile Allance 2002 KML 2.0 extensible Right Markup Language V2.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 REI 10 Right Expression and Interpretation v1.0 Kagat, Paolucer, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Sycara 2002 PJP 1.0 Platform for Privacy Preferences v1.0 W3C 2003 APFEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language v1.0 W3C 2004 PL Dornit Policy Language Milosevic & Dromey 2005	2000	(D)TPL	(Defined) Trust Policy Language	IBM Research
2000 PAPL Person Allocation Policy Language Boratit & Samarati 2001 DDRL 1.0 Open Digital Rights Language V1.0 W3C 2001 XMCL eXtensible Media Commerce Language Real/Networks 2001 K.CL Enterprise Contract Language Neal 2001 K.SEC Bertino, Castano & Ferrani 2001 K.SEC Bertino, Castano & Ferrani 2001 K.SEC Bertino, Castano & Ferrani 2002 ODRI, 1.1 Open Digital Rights Language V1.0 W3C 2002 ODRI, 1.1 Open Digital Rights Language V1.1 W3C 2002 OMA DRN 1.0 OMA DRN Rights Expression Language V1.0 Open Mobile Alliance 2002 KML CPP/A 2.0 Apgreement V2.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 REI 1.0 Rights Expression and Interpretation v1.0 Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Sycara 2002 PSP 1.0 Platform for Privacy Preferences V1.0 W3C 2003 APFG-21 The Moving Picture Experts Group 2004 MPGC-21 The Moving Picture Experts Gr	2000	PSPL	Portfolio and Service Protection Language	Bonatti & Samarati
Open Digital Rights Language VI.0 W3C 2001 CML 1.0 Open Digital Rights Language RealNetworks 2001 KCL Extensible Media Commerce Language RealNetworks 2001 KCL Extensible Media Commerce Language RealNetworks 2001 KSEC Bertino, Castano & Ferrart 2001 FRMI. Enterprise Ortract Language Zero-Knowledge Systems & HBM 2002 MA DRM 100 MAD RM Rights Expression Language V1.0 Open Mobile Allance Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 XAML 2.0 eXtensible Right Markup Language V2.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 XAML 2.0 eXtensible Right Markup Language V1.0 Masci 2002 PAP I.0 Plafform for Privacy Preferences V1.0 W3C 2002 PAP I.0 Plafform for Privacy Preferences V1.0 W3C 2003 OHPL Doetin Folicy Language Milosevic & Drome 2003 WSOL Web Service Colf Agreement Keller & Ladwig 2003 WSOL Web Service Colf Agreement Keller & Ladwig 2003	2000	PAPL	Person Allocation Policy Language	Bonatti & Samarati
Construction Construction Construction 2001 KMCL eXtexnible Media Commerce Language RealNetworks 2001 KSEC Enterprise Contract Language Neal 2001 KSEC Bertino, Castano & Ferrari 2001 KSEC Bertino, Castano & Ferrari 2001 KSEC Bertino, Castano & Ferrari 2001 CDRL Enterprise Privacy Markup Language Zero-Knowledge Systems & IBM 2002 ODRL 1.1 Open Digital Rights Language V.1 W3C 2002 CML DP/A 2.0 eXtensible Right Markup Language V.0 Open Mobile Alliance 2002 CML CP/A 2.0 eXtensible Right Markup Language V.0 OASIS 2002 PAPL Patiorm for Privacy Preferences v.1.0 W3C 2002 PAPL A PB Preference Exchange Language V.0 W3C 2003 MPEG-21 Deontic Policy Language Tokery Pagurek, Patel, Esfandari & Ma 2003 WSOL Web Service Coffering Language Tokery Pagurek, Patel, Esfandari & Ma 2003 SwectDeal Grosof & Poon Grosof & Poon	2000	ODRI 1.0	Open Digital Rights Language v1 0	W3C
2001 EACL Enterprise Contract Language Neal 2001 EACL Enterprise Contract Language Neal 2001 RXEL Privacy Rights Markup Language Real 2001 PRML Privacy Rights Markup Language Zero-Knowledge Systems & IBM 2001 PRML Enterprise Privacy Markup Language Zero-Knowledge Systems & IBM 2002 OMA DRM 1.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v1.1 W3C 2002 KML C21 eXtensible Right Markup Language v2.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 EXML Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.0 M3C 2002 P3P 1.0 Rights Expression and Interpretation v1.0 Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Sycara 2003 APPEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language Milosvite & Dromey 2004 DPL Doontic Policy Language The Moving Picture Experts Group 2003 WFEG-21 The Moving Picture Experts Group Oracs Pagurek, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 WeB Service Level Agreement Keller & Ludwig Kacks 2003 K	2001	VMCI	aVtensible Media Commerce Language	PaelNetworks
Lot Ext. Interpret Contract Language Pertino, Castano & Ferrari 2001 X-SEC Berlino, Castano & Ferrari 2001 PRML Privacy Rights Markup Language Zero-Knowledge Systems & IBM 2002 ODRL F11 Open Digital Rights Language VLO Open Mobile Alliance 2002 OMA DRM 1.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v1.0 Open Mobile Alliance 2002 rexemble Kight Markup Language v2.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 rexemble Kight Markup Language v2.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 rexemble Kight Markup Language v1.0 W3C 2002 APPEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language v1.0 W3C 2003 MSC-U Deontic Policy Language Toesis, PagureL, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 WSLA Web Service Offring Language Torsis, PagureL, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 WSLA Web Service Offring Language Torsis, PagureL, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 WSLA Web Service Offring Language Torsis, PagureL, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 SACKL 1.0 eXtensible Acceese Cont	2001	ECI	Enterprise Contract Language	Neel
1001 PASIC Definition Castinative Permany 1001 PRML Privacy Rights Markup Language Zero-Knowledge Systems & IBM 1002 ODR1 11 Open Digital Rights Language V1 W3C 1002 ODR1 11 Open Digital Rights Language V1 W3C 1002 OKA DRM 1.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language V1.0 Open Mobile Alliance 1002 eXtensible Right Markup Language V2.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 1002 eXtensible Right Markup Language V2.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 1002 eXtensible Right Markup Language V1.0 M3C 1002 P3P 1.0 Platform for Privacy Preferences v1.0 W3C 1002 P4PEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language V1.0 W3C 1003 Obenite Policy Language Milosevic & Dromey D001 1003 WSOL Web Service Offering Language Tosic, Pagurek, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 103 WSOL Web Service Cortorl Markup Language OASIS 1043 WSOL Web Service Cortorl Markup Language OASIS 1053 SecetDeal	2001	ECL V SEC		Neal Derting Costang & Forrari
2001 FNML Firvacy Markup Language Zero-Knowledge Systems & IBM 2002 OPRL Enterprise Privacy Markup Language Zero-Knowledge Systems & IBM 2002 OMA DRM TI.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v1.0 Open Mobile Alliance 2002 KrML 2.0 extensible Right Markup Language v2.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 cbXML CPP/A 2.0 ebXML. Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.0 OASIS 2002 RET 1.0 Rights Expression and Interpretation v1.0 Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Sycara 2002 APPEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language v1.0 W3C 2003 MPEG-21 The Moving Picture Experts Group 2003 WSOL Web Service Offering Language Tosis, Pagurek, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 WSOL Web Service Coll Frigging and Transmission Standard Keller & Ladwig 2003 SweetDeal Grosof & Poon Grosof & Poon 2004 OMA DRM Y2.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language V1 Open Bloak Forum 2003 KACML 1.0 eXtensible Access Control Markup Language OASIS 2003 SweetDeal Grosof & Poon Grosof & Poon 2004 MAN DRM Y2.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language V2.0 Open Mobile Alliance </td <td>2001</td> <td>A-SEC</td> <td>Driveey Dichte Merlynn Lenguege</td> <td>Zara Knowledge Systems & IDM</td>	2001	A-SEC	Driveey Dichte Merlynn Lenguege	Zara Knowledge Systems & IDM
2000 DPRL 1.1 Open Digital Rights Language V1.0 W3C 2002 DDR 1.1 Open Digital Rights Language V1.0 W3C 2002 XrML 2.0 eXtensible Right Markup Language V1.0 Open Mohle Alliance 2002 XrML 2.0 eXtensible Right Markup Language V2.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 eXtML CPP/A.20 eSMML Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement V2.0 CASIS 2002 PEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language V1.0 W3C 2002 APPEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language V1.0 W3C 2003 MPEG-21 Doentic Policy Language Milosevic & Dromey 2003 MEG-321 Open eBook Forum REL Open eBook Forum 2003 WSLA Web Service Coll Agreement Keller & Ludwig 2003 SACALL 1.0 eXtensible Access Control Markup Language OASIS 2003 SweetDeal Usork, Bradshaw, Jeffers, Suri, Hayes, Breedy, Bunch, Johnson, Kulkarni & Lott 2004 METSRights Metadata Eacoding and Transmission Standard Library of Congress 2004 MADR 2.0 OMA DRM	2001	FRML		Zero-Knowledge Systems & IBM
2002 ODR. 1.1 Open Digital Rights Expression Language V1.0 Open Mobile Alliance 2002 XXML 2.0 eXtensible Right Sepression Language V2.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 XXML 2.0 eXtensible Right Sepression Language V2.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 REI 1.0 Rights Expression and Interpretation V1.0 Kagal, Paolucei, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Sycara 2002 APPEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language V1.0 W3C 2003 MPEG-21 Deontic Policy Language Milosevic & Dromey 2003 WSDL Web Service Offering Language Tosic, Pagurek, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 WSOL Web Service Clevel Agreement Keller & Ladwig 2003 SweetDeal Grosof & Poon Kalarari & Lott 2003 SweetDeal Enterprise Privacy Authorization Language OASIS 2004 MAD RM 2.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language V2.0 Open Hobole Alliance 2004 MAD RM 2.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language V2.0 Open Mobile Alliance 2004 MAD RM 2.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language	2001	EPML	Enterprise Privacy Markup Language	Zero-Knowledge Systems & IBM
2002 DMA DKM 1.0 OMA DKM kights Expression Language V1.0 Open Mobile Alliance 2002 XML 2.0 eXtensible kight Markup Language v2.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 kRL1 Rights Expression and Interpretation v1.0 Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Sycara 2002 P3P1.0 Platform for Privacy Preferences v1.0 W3C 2002 APP EL A P3P Preference Exchange Language v1.0 W3C 2003 OEB FRL Deontic Policy Language Milosevic & Dromey 2003 OEB FRL Open eBook Forum REL Open eBook Forum 2003 WSDL Web Service Offering Language Tosic, Pagurek, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 WSDL Web Service Cortorl Markup Language OaxIS 2003 SweetDeal Grosof & Poon Grosof & Poon 2003 KAOS Uzeok, Bradshaw, Jeffers, Suri, Hayes, Breedy, Bunch, Johnson, Kulkarni & Lott 2004 METSRights Metadata Encoding and Transmission Standard Rights Library of Congress 2004 TV Anytime RMPI If V Anytime Rights Management and Protoction Informatic & Manceed Audio Video Coding Standard Rights </td <td>2002</td> <td>ODKL 1.1</td> <td>Open Digital Rights Language VI.I</td> <td></td>	2002	ODKL 1.1	Open Digital Rights Language VI.I	
2002 XrML 2.0 extensible Kight Markup Language v.0.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 ebXML CPP/A.2.0 ebXML CV 2.0 Goxement v2.0 Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2002 repertence Schange Language v1.0 Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Sycara 2002 APPEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language v1.0 W3C 2003 MPEG-21 The Moving Preture Experts Group 2003 WSLA Web Service Level Agreement Keller & Ludwig 2003 WSLA Web Service Cevel Agreement Keller & Ludwig 2003 SweetDeal Grosof & Poon OASIS 2003 SweetDeal Grosof & Poon String Spin Spin Spin Spin Spin Spin Spin Spin	2002	OMA DRM 1.0	OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v1.0	Open Mobile Alliance
2002 ebXML CPP/A 2.0 ebXML Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.0 OASIS 2002 REI 1.0 Rights Expression and Interpretation v1.0 Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Sycara 2002 P3P 1.0 Platform for Privacy Preferences v1.0 W3C 2002 APPEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language v1.0 W3C 2003 DPL Deontic Policy Language Milosevic & Dromey 2003 OBF REL Open eBook Forum REL Open eBook Forum 2003 WSOL Web Service Offering Language Tosic, Pagurek, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 WSLA Web Service Control Markup Language OASIS 2003 Sweetbeal Grosof & Poon Grosof & Poon 2003 KAoS Uszok, Bradshaw, Jeffers, Suri, Hayes, Breedy, Bunch, Johnson, Kulkarni & Lott 2004 OMA DRM 2.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v2.0 Open Mobile Alliance 2004 TV Anytime RMPI Information Library of Congress 2004 AVS-REL Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights 2004	2002	XrML 2.0	eXtensible Right Markup Language v2.0	Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off)
2002 REI 1.0 Rights Expression and Interpretation v1.0 Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Sycara 2002 P3P 1.0 Platform for Privacy Preference sx.1.0 W3C 2002 APPEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language v1.0 W3C 2003 OEB FRL Open eBook Forum REL Open eBook Forum 2003 OEB FRL Open eBook Forum REL Open eBook Forum 2003 WSLA Web Service Level Agreement Keller & Ludwig 2003 SweetDeal Centersible Access Control Markup Language OASIS 2003 SweetDeal Enterprise Privacy Authorization Language IBM 2004 KAoS Metadata Encoding and Transmission Standard Rights Library of Congress 2004 TV Anytime Rights Management and Protection Information European Broadcasting Union Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Right 2004 WAS PRL Business Contract Language Governatori & Milosevic 2004 WAS PRL Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Right Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Right 2004 TV Anytime Rights Management and Protection Information Informati	2002	ebXML CPP/A 2.0	ebXML Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.0	OASIS
2002 P3P 1.0 Platform for Privacy Preferences v1.0 W3C 2002 APPEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language v1.0 W3C 2002 DPL Deontic Policy Language Milosevic & Dromey 2003 MPEG-21 The Moving Picture Experts Group 2003 WSDL Web Service Offering Language Tosk, Pagurek, Patel, Estandiari & Ma 2003 WSLA Web Service Control Markup Language Tosk, Pagurek, Patel, Estandiari & Ma 2003 WSLA Web Service Control Markup Language OASIS 2003 SweetDeal Grosof & Poon Consof & Poon 2004 EAL Enterprise Privacy Authorization Language v2.0 Open eBook Forum 2004 METSRights Metadata Encoding and Transmission Standard Rights Library of Congress 2004 OMA DRM 2.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v2.0 Open eBook Folder (AVS) Workgroup 2004 TV Anytime RMPI TV Anytime Rights Management and Protection Information Expression Language Governatori & Milosevic 2004 DVA RVS-REL Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Expression Language	2002	REI 1.0	Rights Expression and Interpretation v1.0	Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Sycara
2002 APPEL A P3P Preference Exchange Language v1.0 W3C 2002 DPL Deontic Policy Language Milosevic & Dromey 2003 MPEG-21 The Moving Picture Experts Group 2003 WSOL Web Service Offering Language Tosic, Pagurek, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 WSOL Web Service Offering Language Tosic, Pagurek, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 WSLA Web Service Offering Language Tosic, Pagurek, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 WSLA Web Service Offering Language OASIS 2003 SweetDeal Grosof & Poon 2003 EPAL Enterprise Privacy Authorization Language IBM 2004 METSRights Metadata Encoding and Transmission Standard Library of Congress 2004 OMA DRM 2.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v2.0 Open Mobile Alliance Expression Language 2004 AVS-REL Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights 2004 AVS-REL Business Contract Language Governatori & Milosevic 2004 BCL Bu	2002	P3P 1.0	Platform for Privacy Preferences v1.0	W3C
2002 DPL Deontic Policy Language Milosevic & Dromey 2003 MPEG-21 The Moving Picture Experts Group 2003 WSOL Web Service Offering Language Tosic, Pagurek, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 WSLA Web Service Level Agreement Keller & Ludwig 2003 XACML 1.0 eXtensible Access Control Markup Language V1.0 OASIS 2003 SweetDeal Grosof & Poon Grosof & Poon 2003 KAoS Hetadata Encoding and Transmission Standard Rights Library of Congress 2004 METSRights Metadata Encoding and Transmission Standard Rights Library of Congress 2004 TV Anytime RMPI TV Anytime RMPI Information European Broadcasting Union 2004 AVS-REL Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights 2004 WSPL Web Services Policy Language Vedamutu, Orchard, Hirsch, Hondo, Yendluri, Bubez & Yacinalp 2004 SLAng SLA notation generator Skene, Lamanna & Emmerich 2004 SC REL Metadata Inguage Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) <td>2002</td> <td>APPEL</td> <td>A P3P Preference Exchange Language v1.0</td> <td>W3C</td>	2002	APPEL	A P3P Preference Exchange Language v1.0	W3C
2003 MPEG-21 The Moving Picture Experts Group 2003 VeSD Open eBook Forum REL Open eBook Forum 2003 WSOL Web Service Offering Language Tosic, Pagurek, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 WSOL Web Service Level Agreement Keller & Ludwig 2003 XACML 1.0 eXtensible Access Control Markup Language v1.0 OASIS 2003 SweetDeal Grosof & Poon Grosof & Poon 2004 EPAL Enterprise Privacy Authorization Language IBM 2004 METSRights Metadata Encoding and Transmission Standard Rights Library of Congress 2004 OMA DRM 2.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v2.0 Open Mobile Alliance 2004 TV Anytime RMPI TV Anytime Rights Management and Protection Information European Broadcasting Union 2004 AVS-REL Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Expression Language Governatori & Milosevic 2004 WSPL Web Services Policy Language Vedamuthu, Orchard, Hirsch, Hondo, Yendluri, Bubez & Yacinalp 2004 SLAng SLAng totan ogenerator Skene, Lamanna & Emmerich	2002	DPL	Deontic Policy Language	Milosevic & Dromey
2003 OeBF REL Open eBook Forum REL Open eBook Forum 2003 WSOL Web Service Offering Language Tosic, Pagurek, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 WSLA Web Service Clevel Agreement Keller & Ludwig 2003 XACML 1.0 eXtensible Access Control Markup Language v1.0 OASIS 2003 SweetDeal Grosof & Poon 2003 KAoS Uszok, Bradshaw, Jeffers, Suri, Hayes, Breedy, Bunch, Johnson, Kulkarni & Lott 2004 METSRights Metadata Encoding and Transmission Standard Rights Library of Congress 2004 OMA DRM 2.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v2.0 Open Mobile Alliance 2004 AVS-REL Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Expression Language Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights 2004 AVS-REL Business Contract Language Governatori & Milosevic 2004 WSPL Web Services Policy Language Vedamuthu, Orchard, Hirsch, Hondo, Yendluri, Bubez & Yacinalp 2004 SLAng SLA notation generator Skene, Lamanna & Emmerich 2004 PPAL Declarative Privacy Authorization Language n.s. 2004 POPL Declarative Privacy Authorization Language Content Guard (Arsox Park Spin Off) 2004 PPAL Declarative Privacy Authorization Language	2003	MPEG-21		The Moving Picture Experts Group
2003 WSOL Web Service Offering Language Tosic, Pagurek, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma 2003 WSLA Web Service Level Agreement Keller & Ludwig 2003 XACML 1.0 eXtensible Access Control Markup Language OASIS 2003 SweetDeal Grosof & Poon 2003 EPAL Enterprise Privacy Authorization Language IBM 2003 KAoS Uszok, Bradshaw, Jeffers, Suri, Hayes, Breedy, Bunch, Johnson, Kulkarni & Lott 2004 METSRights Metadata Encoding and Transmission Standard Rights Library of Congress 2004 OMA DRM 2.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v2.0 Open Mobile Alliance European Broadcasting Union 2004 AVS-REL Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Expression Language Governatori & Milosevic 2004 BCL Business Contract Language Governatori & Milosevic 2004 WSPL Web Services Policy Language Nearent of Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2004 BCL Business Contract Language Gavriloaie, Nejdl, Olmedilla, Seamons & Winslett 2004 BCL Beclarative Privacy Authorization Language n.s. 2004 BCL Beclar	2003	OeBF REL	Open eBook Forum REL	Open eBook Forum
2003 WSLA Web Service Level Agreement Keller & Ludwig 2003 XACML 1.0 eXtensible Access Control Markup Language OASIS 2003 SweetDeal Grosof & Poon Grosof & Poon 2003 EPAL Enterprise Privacy Authorization Language IBM 2003 KAoS Metadata Encoding and Transmission Standard Library of Congress 2004 METSRights Metadata Encoding and Transmission Standard Library of Congress 2004 OMA DRM 2.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v2.0 Open Mobile Alliance 2004 TV Anytime RMPI TV Anytime Rights Management and Protection European Broadcasting Union 2004 AVS-REL Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard (A VS) Workgroup 2004 BCL Business Contract Language Governatori & Milosevic 2004 WSPL Web Services Policy Language Vedamuthu, Orchard, Hirsch, Hondo, Yendluri, Bubez & Yacinalp 2004 BCL Business Contract Language Content Guartia & Aeronas & Winslett 2004 SLAng SLA notation generator Skene, Lamanna & Emmerich 2004 BPAL De	2003	WSOL	Web Service Offering Language	Tosic, Pagurek, Patel, Esfandiari & Ma
2003 XACML 1.0 eXtensible Access Control Markup Language 1.0 OASIS 2003 SweetDeal Grosof & Poon 2003 EPAL Enterprise Privacy Authorization Language IBM 2004 METSRights Metadata Encoding and Transmission Standard Rights Uszok, Bradshaw, Jeffers, Suri, Hayes, Breedy, Bunch, Johnson, Kulkarni & Lott 2004 MA DRM 2.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v2.0 Open Mobile Alliance 2004 TV Anytime Rights Management and Protection Information European Broadcasting Union 2004 AVS-REL Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Expression Language Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights 2004 BCL Business Contract Language Governatori & Milosevic 2004 WSPL Web Services Policy Language Vedamuthu, Orchard, Hirsch, Hondo, Yendluri, Bubez & Yacinalp 2004 BCL Business Contract Language Skene, Lamanna & Emmerich 2004 SLA ng SLA notation generator Skene, Lamanna & Emmerich 2004 SOR REL MPEG-21 Intellectual Property Management and Protection The Moving Picture Experts Group 2004 PLUS Picture Licensing Universal System PLUS Coalition <t< td=""><td>2003</td><td>WSLA</td><td>Web Service Level Agreement</td><td>Keller & Ludwig</td></t<>	2003	WSLA	Web Service Level Agreement	Keller & Ludwig
2003 SweetDeal Grosof & Poon 2003 EPAL Enterprise Privacy Authorization Language IBM 2003 KAoS Uszok, Bradshaw, Jeffers, Suri, Hayes, Breedy, Bunch, Johnson, Kulkarni & Lott 2004 METSRights Metadata Encoding and Transmission Standard Library of Congress 2004 OMA DRM 2.0 OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v2.0 Open Mobile Alliance 2004 TV Anytime RMPI TV Anytime Rights Management and Protection Information European Broadcasting Union 2004 AVS-REL Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Expression Language Governatori & Milosevic 2004 BCL Business Contract Language Governatori & Milosevic 2004 WSPL Web Services Policy Language Vedamuthu, Orchard, Hirsch, Hondo, Yendluri, Bubez & Yacinalp 2004 BLA Declarative Privacy Authorization Language S.s. 2004 PAL Declarative Privacy Authorization Language Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2004 BLAng SLA notation generator Sken, Lamanna & Emmerich 2004 ISO REL Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off)	2003	XACML 1.0	eXtensible Access Control Markup Language	OASIS
2003EPALEnterprise Privacy Authorization LanguageIBM2003EPALEnterprise Privacy Authorization LanguageIBM2003KAoSUszok, Bradshaw, Jeffers, Suri, Hayes, Breedy, Bunch, Johnson, Kulkarni & Lott2004METSRightsMetadata Encoding and Transmission Standard RightsLibrary of Congress2004OMA DRM 2.0OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v2.0Open Mobile Alliance2004TV Anytime RMPIInformationEuropean Broadcasting Union2004AVS-RELAdvanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Expression LanguageAdvanced Audio Video Coding Standard (AVS) Workgroup2004BCLBusiness Contract LanguageGovernatori & Milosevic2004WSPLWeb Services Policy LanguageVedamuthu, Orchard, Hirsch, Hondo, Yendluri, Bubez & Yacinalp2004DPALDeclarative Privacy Authorization Languagen.s.2004SLAngSLA notation generatorSkene, Lamanna & Emmerich2004ISO RELMPEG-21 Intellectual Property Management and ProtectionThe Moving Picture Experts Group2004PLUSPicture Licensing Universal SystemPLUS Coalition2005PRISM RLPublishing Requirements for Industry Standard Agreement v2.1Idealliance2005ProtunePRovisional TrUst NEgotiation frameworkDe Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro2005ProtunePRovisional TrUst NEgotiation frameworkDe Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro2005ProtunePRovisional TrUst NEgotiation frameworkDe Coi, Olmedilla, Bonat	2003	SweetDeal		Grosof & Poon
2003Enterprise Trively Future Futur	2003	EPAL	Enterprise Privacy Authorization Language	IBM
2003KAoSSubstruct Process2004METSRightsMetadata Encoding and Transmission Standard RightsLibrary of Congress2004OMA DRM 2.0OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v2.0Open Mobile Alliance2004TV Anytime RMPITV Anytime Rights Management and Protection InformationEuropean Broadcasting Union2004AVS-RELAdvanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Expression LanguageAdvanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights2004BCLBusiness Contract LanguageGovernatori & Milosevic2004WSPLWeb Services Policy LanguageVedamuthu, Orchard, Hirsch, Hondo, Yendluri, Bubez & Yacinalp2004SLAngSLA notation generatorSkene, Lamanna & Emmerich2004PeerTrustGavriloaie, Nejdl, Olmedilla, Seamons & Winslett2004ISO RELPicture Licensing Universal SystemPLUS2004PLUSPicture Licensing Universal SystemPLUS Coalition2005ebXML CPP/A 2.1ebXML Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.1OASIS2005ProtunePRovisional TrUst NEgotiation frameworkDe Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro2005ProtunePRovisional TrUst NEgotiation frameworkDe Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro2005REI 2.0Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0KagaL Paolucci. Srinivasan. Denker. Finin & Svcara	2005			Uszok Bradshaw Jeffers Suri Haves Breedy Bunch Johnson
2004METSRightsMetadata Encoding and Transmission Standard RightsLibrary of Congress2004OMA DRM 2.0OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v2.0Open Mobile Alliance2004TV Anytime RMPITV Anytime Rights Management and Protection InformationEuropean Broadcasting Union2004AVS-RELAdvanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Expression LanguageAdvanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard (AVS) Workgroup2004BCLBusiness Contract LanguageGovernatori & Milosevic2004WSPLWeb Services Policy LanguageVedamuthu, Orchard, Hirsch, Hondo, Yendluri, Bubez & Yacinalp2004DPALDeclarative Privacy Authorization Languagen.s.2004SLAngSLA notation generatorSkene, Lamanna & Emmerich2004ISO RELContent Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off)2004ISO RELProtectionThe Moving Picture Experts Group2004PLUSPicture Licensing Universal SystemPLUS Coalition2005PRISM RLPublishing Requirements for Industry Standard Agreement v2.1Idealliance2005ProtunePRovisional Trust NEgotiation Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.1OASIS2005ProtunePRovisional Trust NEgotiation frameworkDe Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro2005ProtunePRovisional Interpretation v2.0Kaeal, Paolucci, Stinivasan, Denker, Finin & Svcara	2003	KAoS		Kulkarni & Lott
2004OMA DRM 2.0OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v2.0Open Mobile Alliance2004TV Anytime RMPITV Anytime Rights Management and Protection InformationEuropean Broadcasting Union2004AVS-RELAdvanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Expression LanguageAdvanced Audio Video Coding Standard (AVS) Workgroup2004BCLBusiness Contract LanguageGovernatori & Milosevic2004WSPLWeb Services Policy LanguageVedamuthu, Orchard, Hirsch, Hondo, Yendluri, Bubez & Yacinalp2004DPALDeclarative Privacy Authorization Languagen.s.2004SLAngSLA notation generatorSkene, Lamanna & Emmerich2004ISO RELMPEG-21 Intellectual Property Management and ProtectionThe Moving Picture Experts Group2004PLUSPicture Licensing Universal SystemPLUS Coalition2005PRISM RLPublishing Requirements for Industry Standard Agreement v2.1Idealliance2005ProtunePRovisional TrUst NEgotiation frameworkDe Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro2005REI 2.0Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Sycara	2004	METSRights	Rights Recoding and Transmission Standard	Library of Congress
2004TV Anytime RMPITV Anytime Rights Management and Protection InformationEuropean Broadcasting Union2004AVS-RELAdvanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Expression LanguageAdvanced Audio Video Coding Standard (AVS) Workgroup2004BCLBusiness Contract LanguageGovernatori & Milosevic2004WSPLWeb Services Policy LanguageVedamuthu, Orchard, Hirsch, Hondo, Yendluri, Bubez & Yacinalp2004DPALDeclarative Privacy Authorization Languagen.s.2004SLAngSLA notation generatorSkene, Lamanna & Emmerich2004ISO RELMPEG-21 Intellectual Property Management and ProtectionThe Moving Picture Experts Group2004PLUSPicture Licensing Universal SystemPLUS Coalition2005PRISM RLPublishing Requirements for Industry Standard Agreement v2.1Idealliance2005ProtunePRovisional TrUst NEgotiation frameworkDe Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro2005REI 2.0Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0Kagal Paolucci, Strinivasan, Denker, Finin & Svcara	2004	OMA DRM 2.0	OMA DRM Rights Expression Language v2.0	Open Mobile Alliance
2004AVS-RELAdvanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Expression LanguageAdvanced Audio Video Coding Standard (AVS) Workgroup2004BCLBusiness Contract LanguageGovernatori & Milosevic2004WSPLWeb Services Policy LanguageVedamuthu, Orchard, Hirsch, Hondo, Yendluri, Bubez & Yacinalp2004DPALDeclarative Privacy Authorization Languagen.s.2004SLAngSLA notation generatorSkene, Lamanna & Emmerich2004PeerTrustGavriloaie, Nejdl, Olmedilla, Seamons & Winslett2004ISO RELContent Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off)2004PLUSPicture Licensing Universal SystemPLUS Coalition2005PRISM RLPublishing Requirements for Industry Standard Agreement v2.1Idealliance2005ProtunePRovisional TrUst NEgotiation frameworkDe Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro2005REI 2.0Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0Kagal. Paolucci. Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Svcara	2004	TV Anytime RMPI	TV Anytime Rights Management and Protection Information	European Broadcasting Union
2004BCLBusiness Contract LanguageGovernatori & Milosevic2004WSPLWeb Services Policy LanguageVedamuthu, Orchard, Hirsch, Hondo, Yendluri, Bubez & Yacinalp2004DPALDeclarative Privacy Authorization Languagen.s.2004SLAngSLA notation generatorSkene, Lamanna & Emmerich2004PeerTrustGavriloaie, Nejdl, Olmedilla, Seamons & Winslett2004ISO RELContent Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off)2004MPEG-21 Intellectual Property Management and ProtectionThe Moving Picture Experts Group2005PRISM RLPublishing Requirements for Industry Standard Agreement v2.1Idealliance2005ProtunePRovisional TrUst NEgotiation frameworkDe Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro2005REI 2.0Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Svcara	2004	AVS-REL	Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard Rights Expression Language	Advanced Audio Video Coding Standard (AVS) Workgroup
2004WSPLWeb Services Policy LanguageVedamuthu, Orchard, Hirsch, Hondo, Yendluri, Bubez & Yacinalp2004DPALDeclarative Privacy Authorization Languagen.s.2004SLAngSLA notation generatorSkene, Lamanna & Emmerich2004PeerTrustGavriloaie, Nejdl, Olmedilla, Seamons & Winslett2004ISO RELContent Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off)2004MPEG-21 IPMPMPEG-21 Intellectual Property Management and ProtectionThe Moving Picture Experts Group2004PLUSPicture Licensing Universal SystemPLUS Coalition2005PRISM RLPublishing Requirements for Industry Standard Agreement v2.1Idealliance2005ProtunePRovisional TrUst NEgotiation frameworkDe Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro2005REI 2.0Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Svcara	2004	BCL	Business Contract Language	Governatori & Milosevic
2004DPALDeclarative Privacy Authorization Languagen.s.2004SLAngSLA notation generatorSkene, Lamanna & Emmerich2004PeerTrustGavriloaie, Nejdl, Olmedilla, Seamons & Winslett2004ISO RELContent Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off)2004MPEG-21 IPMPMPEG-21 Intellectual Property Management and ProtectionThe Moving Picture Experts Group2004PLUSPicture Licensing Universal SystemPLUS Coalition2005PRISM RLPublishing Requirements for Industry Standard Metadata Rights LanguageIdealliance2005ebXML CPP/A 2.1ebXML Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.1OASIS2005ProtunePRovisional TrUst NEgotiation frameworkDe Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro2005REI 2.0Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Svcara	2004	WSPL	Web Services Policy Language	Vedamuthu, Orchard, Hirsch, Hondo, Yendluri, Bubez & Yacinalp
2004 SLAng SLA notation generator Skene, Lamanna & Emmerich 2004 PeerTrust Gavriloaie, Nejdl, Olmedilla, Seamons & Winslett 2004 ISO REL Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2004 MPEG-21 IPMP MPEG-21 Intellectual Property Management and Protection The Moving Picture Experts Group 2004 PLUS Picture Licensing Universal System PLUS Coalition 2005 PRISM RL Publishing Requirements for Industry Standard Metadata Rights Language Idealliance 2005 ebXML CPP/A 2.1 ebXML Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.1 OASIS 2005 Protune PRovisional TrUst NEgotiation framework De Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro 2005 REI 2.0 Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0 Kagal. Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Svcara	2004	DPAL	Declarative Privacy Authorization Language	n.s.
2004 PeerTrust Gavriloaie, Nejdl, Olmedilla, Seamons & Winslett 2004 ISO REL Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2004 MPEG-21 IPMP MPEG-21 Intellectual Property Management and Protection The Moving Picture Experts Group 2004 PLUS Picture Licensing Universal System PLUS Coalition 2005 PRISM RL Publishing Requirements for Industry Standard Metadata Rights Language Idealliance 2005 ebXML CPP/A 2.1 ebXML Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.1 OASIS 2005 Protune PRovisional TrUst NEgotiation framework De Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro 2005 REI 2.0 Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0 Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Svcara	2004	SLAng	SLA notation generator	Skene, Lamanna & Emmerich
2004 ISO REL Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off) 2004 MPEG-21 IPMP MPEG-21 Intellectual Property Management and Protection The Moving Picture Experts Group 2004 PLUS Picture Licensing Universal System PLUS Coalition 2005 PRISM RL Publishing Requirements for Industry Standard Metadata Rights Language Idealliance 2005 ebXML CPP/A 2.1 ebXML Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.1 OASIS 2005 Protune PRovisional TrUst NEgotiation framework De Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro 2005 REI 2.0 Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0 Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Svcara	2004	PeerTrust		Gavriloaie, Neidl, Olmedilla, Seamons & Winslett
2004 MPEG-21 IPMP MPEG-21 Intellectual Property Management and Protection The Moving Picture Experts Group 2004 PLUS Picture Licensing Universal System PLUS Coalition 2005 PRISM RL Publishing Requirements for Industry Standard Metadata Rights Language Idealliance 2005 ebXML CPP/A 2.1 ebXML Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.1 OASIS 2005 Protune PRovisional TrUst NEgotiation framework De Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro 2005 REI 2.0 Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0 Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Svcara	2004	ISO REL		Content Guard (a Xerox Park Spin Off)
2004 PLUS Picture Licensing Universal System PLUS Coalition 2005 PRISM RL Publishing Requirements for Industry Standard Metadata Rights Language Idealliance 2005 ebXML CPP/A 2.1 ebXML Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.1 OASIS 2005 Protune PRovisional TrUst NEgotiation framework De Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro 2005 REI 2.0 Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0 Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Svcara	2004	MPEG-21 IPMP	MPEG-21 Intellectual Property Management and Protection	The Moving Picture Experts Group
2005 PRISM RL Publishing Requirements for Industry Standard Metadata Rights Language Idealliance 2005 ebXML CPP/A 2.1 ebXML Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.1 OASIS 2005 Protune PRovisional TrUst NEgotiation framework De Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro 2005 REI 2.0 Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0 Kagal. Paolucci. Srinivasan. Denker. Finin & Svcara	2004	PLUS	Picture Licensing Universal System	PLUS Coalition
2005 ebXML CPP/A 2.1 ebXML Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.1 OASIS 2005 Protune PRovisional TrUst NEgotiation framework De Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro 2005 REI 2.0 Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0 Kagal. Paolucci. Srinivasan. Denker. Finin & Svcara	2005	PRISM RL	Publishing Requirements for Industry Standard Metadata Rights Language	Idealliance
2005 Protune PRovisional TrUst NEgotiation framework De Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro 2005 REI 2.0 Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0 Kagal. Paolucci. Srinivasan. Denker. Finin & Svcara	2005	ebXML CPP/A 2.1	ebXML Collaboration Protocol Profile and Agreement v2.1	OASIS
2005 REI 2.0 Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0 Kagal. Paolucci. Srinivasan. Denker. Finin & Svcara	2005	Protune	PRovisional TrUst NEgotiation framework	De Coi, Olmedilla, Bonatti & Sauro
	2005	REI 2.0	Rights Expression and Interpretation v2.0	Kagal, Paolucci, Srinivasan, Denker, Finin & Sycara

2005	P3P 1.1	Platform for Privacy Preferences v1.1	W3C
2006	XACML 2.0	eXtensible Access Control Markup Language v2.0	OASIS
2006	LicenseScript		Chong, Corin, Etalle, Hartel, Jonker & Law
2007	WS-Policy	Web Services Policy	Anderson
2007	ACAP 1.0	Automated Content Access Protocol v1.0	International Press Telecommunications Council
2007	WS-Agreement	Web Services Agreement Specification	Open Grid Forum
2007	OSL	Obligation Specification Language	Hilty, Pretschner, Basin, Schaefer & Walter
2008	ODRL-S	Open Digital Rights Language for Services	Gangadharan, D'Andrea, Iannella & Weiss
2008	ccREL	Creative Commons Rights Expression Language	Creative Commons Foundation / W3C
2009	ExRiVob	Extended Rights Vocabulary	Wang, Seki & Kameyama
2009	LucScript	Logic-based Usage Control License Script	Zhong, Lin & Guo
2009	ACAP 1.1	Automated Content Access Protocol v1.1	International Press Telecommunications Council
2010	PAPEL	Provenance-Aware Policy definition and Execution Language	Ringelstein & Staab
2012	ODRL 2.0	Open Digital Rights Language	W3C
2013	L4LOD	Licenses for Linked Open Data	Governatori, Rotolo, Villata & Gandon
2013	RightsML	Rights Markup Language	International Press Telecommunication Council
2013	XACML 3.0	eXtensible Access Control Markup Language	OASIS
2013	Legal Rule ML	Legal Rule Markup Language	OASIS
2013	ODRS	Open Data Rights Statement Vocabulary	Dodds
2014	LDR 2.0	Linked Data Rights v2.0	Rodriguez, Poveda-Villalón, Suarez & Gomez
2015	ODRL 2.1	Open Digital Rights Language v2.1	W3C
2015	MPEG-21 CEL	MPEG-21 Contract Expression Language	The Moving Picture Experts Group
2015	MPEG-21 MCO	MPEG-21 Cmedia Contract Ontology	The Moving Picture Experts Group